War Memorial Landscape; From Realism to Metaphor

Mohammad Reza Mehrabani Golzar
Ph.D. Imam Khomeini International University, Qazvin, Iran.
mehrabani777@yahoo.com

Ali Akbar khamseh Ashari
M.A in Landscape Architecture, Imam Khomeini International University, Qazvin, Iran.
akhamseashari@yahoo.com

Abstract | War is not a pleasant phenomenon that its remembrance for society would be desirable. But beyond the dark and bitter aspects of each war, there are also white aspects to notice and even remind it to new generations. Undoubtedly every battle has faced prowess, sacrifice and patriotism of the people who devoted their lives for these values. In this case, the remembrance of war in format of memorials should bold memories of these people, evocative places and innate and human values related to war.

War memorials as symbols in daily life of new generations, are supposed to keep the memories of war alive. But how these symbols should be? Is the straight expression of a war artwork, for example a statue of a fighter, a good answer to matter of “remembrance”?

Various examples have been performed with this theme all over the world. This article studies these examples and tries to find a correct answer through them for this question.

The results of the study indicate that on the subject of war memorials, we encounter a spectrum that on one side has realistic and museum view and on the other, metaphorical and abstract view. Although realism communicates faster with audiences, permanence of artwork in audience’s mind would be low because of its simplicity. On the opposite side, memorials which have more complicated layers and are interpretable would perform better as a memorial artwork though they may be infirm at initial attraction for audiences.

Therefore it seems that war memorials corresponding to epic aspects and national values must be presented by allegorical and metaphorical expression and the works that are associated with remembering memories can use realistic expression. Surveying examples states that choosing the proper approach to the subject of memorial, would be more successful at attracting audiences and transferring message to new generation.

Keywords | Memorial Landscape, War, Metaphor, Expression, Formal architecture
Introduction | Memories, especially those with national scale, must be notified to society in some way. This remembrance is a part of social needs that help to community cohesion and its identity (Carolin, 2015). Wars, especially when occur to defend the homeland, are considered as a part of valuable memories of a society and their memories, which contain gallantry and sacrifice of community members, are factors of self-confidence, pride and growth for next generations and remind them that how national values have been formed.

Sometimes these remembrances are with ceremonies. Rituals in war memorials are usually a series of activities that contain tribute to the dead, putting garlands, reading poems and singing hymns in groups. These activities often have symbolic aspects and are held formally and regularly (Bell, 2009). Memorials as visual and objective elements help to reinterpret parts of herd mentality and review memories. Therefore, memorials have a key role in remembering memories for a society and this leads to unity and social solidarity that are the basic values of each society. For responding to those values, a memorial has a “body” with an “expressive face”. Memorial architecture, through the use of symbolic language and its semantic and physical capabilities as an effective artistic media, is a strong type of presentation that is always one of the best choices for cultural expression of communities (Parzadeh, 2014). Sometimes realistic and straight expression of events are used for remembering memories and sometimes it can be more complicated and accompanied by allegorical and metaphorical expression.

Hypothesis
The approach to design war memorials in Iran tends to realistic representation. Also the use of formal and funerary architecture is the basis for designing of memorials. But it seems that the use of metaphorical expression, symbolic architecture and increasing semantic layers can impress audiences effectively, involve them with interpretation and reading the landscape and ensure the permanence and success of the memorial for a more pervasive connection with new generations and continuity of concepts in society. In order to prove the hypothesis above, it's necessary to know that what the aim of creating war memorials is. Which concepts are supposed to be transferred to the audiences? Which approaches are used to express these concepts? And finally, which expressive approach is appropriate for society?

What is the role of war memorials?
War memorials are supposed to discuss reminding, respecting and continuity of a part of a nation's history and express concepts related to war in format of an artwork that has positive values in society. In this way, memorials would join new generation and those who were involved with war, and augment sense of belonging and the meaning of motherland. The word “monument” comes from the Latin “monere” and means connecting, informing and notifying and also stands for sign and mark (Parzadeh, 2014). So the memorial landscape is created for the purpose of informing and connecting a person to a historical event. A memorial space not only transfers the memory of events to the next generation but also is a place for social interactions (Zarghami et.al., 2014). In fact, in today's world, memorials respond to the sociological and psychological requirements of a society in urban landscape.

Memorial buildings are also effective factors in promoting social stability, because of their key role as urban identifying elements, and cause awareness and return to the self by creating sense of belonging, dependence, social interactions and connection with history of a nation and also preservation, augmentation and introduction of social identity. (Ofogh manesh and Naderi shakib, 2014).

Creating memorials, as a form of transferring cultural information to daily life of citizens, cause strengthening the memory of the city and also provide the opportunity of comparing the past and present for citizens (Zarghamiet. al., 2014).

Thus war memorials remind parts of the history of a nation and also embrace the interaction of old and new generation, join them and create social solidarity.

Which concepts are supposed to be transferred to the audience?
Memorials often propound three main themes. One group is assigned to memory of the dead and keeping their names alive (Pic.1) and the second, to preserve and introduce a
specific place in the war (Pic.2). The third group tries to keep the concepts and values that had become bold because of the war, alive in the public perception (Pic.3). Sometimes concepts such as sacrifice, nationalism, unity and etc. are merged in a memorial and attended together.

One of the key concepts in Iran culture is martyrdom. Martyrdom means to be killed in the way of god. As martyr Motahari said: martyrdom is conscious death in the way of sacred goal, a conscious and voluntary act. (Zarghami et. al., 2014).

In addition, in Dehkhoda dictionary the concept of sacrifice, that accompanies martyrdom, means to give up your goals and things that are valuable to you for the sake of another one’s goals and values and that is perfection of generosity. Along these concepts, epic aspects of war are important too. Courage, prowess and resistance of those who attended the battle preserved the country’s honor.

It seems that the indicants of first and second theme, monuments of martyrs and preserving historical places of war, are nearly tangible while the third theme, values and concepts related to war, doesn’t have objective and clear indicants. The third theme often contains abstract concepts that are hard to depict and embody. However there are several global examples that try to embody all these approaches.

Approaches in war memorial landscape Foreign examples

The memorial is built to mention a specific but interpretable event or meaning. This means that the architect or the client of memorial architecture thinks about reinterpretation or recalling of his past or contemporary memories or presenting a notion and ideal of his society (Parzadeh, 2014). Referring to existing examples can be helpful for better recognition of approaches in war memorial landscape. Eleven war memorials are analyzed and studied in this regard (Table 1). This analysis has attempted to study approaches in designing of war memorials besides noting goals, strategies and actions. Also paying attention to context and finding location of memorials can be effective in combination with the landscape and environment.

According to the chart, works like “American merchant mariners’ memorial” (pic.4) try to recreate memories by straight and realistic expression. In “Warsaw uprising monument” (pic. 5), symbolic aspects of artwork are
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Row</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Approach</th>
<th>Goals</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Location finding and establishment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The ring of remembrance of WWI- Notre Dame de Paris</td>
<td>Metaphorical and allegorical expression due to the historical events with abstract architecture</td>
<td>Commemorating the centenary of WWI and respecting soldiers of different nationalities who died during the war</td>
<td>Attention to history and historical events</td>
<td>Building a 328-meter oval ring of light concrete and black granite</td>
<td>Location in a nature-like context, building a 328-meter oval ring of light concrete and black granite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Vietnam Veteran's Memorial</td>
<td>Realistic and objective representation with physical dimensions</td>
<td>Keeping alive the memory of dead Americans of Armed Force and supporting organizations in Australia and New Zealand</td>
<td>Using conceptual art</td>
<td>Writing the name of dead on black stones</td>
<td>Locating at the national monument in the United States and putting the monument in the place of Remembrance Day.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Australian War Memorial</td>
<td>Allegorical and conceptual expression with historical period</td>
<td>Keeping alive the memory of dead Jews of WII and members of Armed Force</td>
<td>Using conceptual art</td>
<td>Writing the name of dead on black stones</td>
<td>Locating in a high traffic place and integrating the monument with the city.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Philadelphia War Memorial</td>
<td>Metaphorical and figurative representation with historical perspective</td>
<td>Keeping alive the memory of dead soldiers of different nationalities</td>
<td>Using conceptual art</td>
<td>Writing the name of dead on black stones</td>
<td>Locating in the heart of the nature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>American Merchant Mariners Memorial</td>
<td>Constructual and metaphorical expression with abstract form</td>
<td>Keeping alive the memory of dead American Merchant Mariners</td>
<td>Using conceptual art</td>
<td>Writing the name of dead on black stones</td>
<td>Locating in a historical building.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The Memorial to the Murdered Jews of Berlin</td>
<td>Constructual and metaphorical expression with abstract form</td>
<td>Keeping alive the memory of dead Jews of WII and members of Armed Force</td>
<td>Using conceptual art</td>
<td>Writing the name of dead on black stones</td>
<td>Locating near the Jewish cemetery.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
National examples

Eight years of imposed war in Iran, provided a theme for emergence of values, such as patriotism, sacrifice and gallantry. After that, memorials were performed for increased. On the contrary, many others of these memorials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source: Authors.</th>
<th>Table 1: The analysis of 11 examples of war memorials around the world.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Brazilian Monument and Tomb of the Unknown Soldier</strong></td>
<td><strong>St. Julien Memorial - Belgium</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct, objective and physical expression</td>
<td>Metaphorical and subjective expression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Keeping alive the memory of unknown Brazilian soldiers who died in WWII</td>
<td>-Keeping alive the memory of dead Canadians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Creating the sense of belonging</td>
<td>-Continuity of historical identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Creating a lively urban area</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Using urban art</strong></td>
<td><strong>Using urban art</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Attention to presence of people</td>
<td>-Using potentials of the environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Connection between memorial and environment</td>
<td>-Using historical dimension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Using visual art</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Using conceptual art</strong></td>
<td><strong>Using real scenes of battle of WWII</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Superhuman height</td>
<td>-Putting flower and candle and communicating with memorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Neutral and dark color of sculptures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Making sculptures that symbolize the dead of air force, army and navy of Brazilian army.</strong></td>
<td><strong>Making a sculpture up to a height of 11 meters</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Scultures of concrete, metal and granite</td>
<td>-Creating greenness around the memorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Holding different ceremonies and dynamics in space</td>
<td>-Awide view to the memorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Building arcade with high altitude</td>
<td>-Using neutral color for the memorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Being the memorial complex on an upper level compared to the other parts</td>
<td>-Using visual art</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Burying 467 of the dead</td>
<td>-Attention to scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Locating the monument in a popular park</strong></td>
<td><strong>Locating the monument in the main place of incident</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Locating in a place that many people see during the day</td>
<td>-Becoming a symbol element because of high altitude of the memorial and wide and open space around it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Locating in a place that many people see during the day</td>
<td>-Due to the location and high altitude, it's considered a sign that makes the readiability in city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Preparing an open space in front of the memorial</td>
<td>-Locating the monument in a popular park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Locating in a place that many people see during the day</td>
<td>-Locating in a high traffic area to remember the memories of war</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Special Issue: War-Scape**
respecting different aspects of this event. In this research some cases of these memorials are analyzed to recognize their positive and negative aspects in the field of design.

- The memorial of anonymous martyrs of Naharkhoran forest

In this memorial the bodies of eight martyrs of Sacred Defense were buried in the Nur-al-shohada hills of Naharkhoran forest in Gorgan. The design of anonymous martyrs’ memorial was defined to keep the memory of these martyrs alive and its spatial organization for visitors was defined in 2009 and completed in 2011 (Pic.6).

Before expressing the memory of the martyrs of the eight years of Sacred Defense, this memorial mentions an Islamic space and also the forms of its design aren’t so relevant to the subject of project. For instance, designers have connected the empty space between two walls to the empty space between two porches of mosques that is not relevant to keep martyrs’ memories alive. Also the texts on geometric apertures are modeled after those of the body of the mosques. Finally this memorial shows us more of a religious and sacred space. The designer has managed to create several steps to show respect to the martyrs. This memorial has tried to increase holiness and connection with a spiritual space but has a poor connection with the concept of martyr and martyrdom.
The memorial of anonymous martyrs of Qom
The memorial of anonymous martyrs of Qom was built in the vicinity of mount al-Khider and is considered as the roof of the city. Its construction steps such as design, destroying old structure and executing the memorial’s structure are accomplished by technical assistance of Foundation for preservation of Sacred Defense works and values. The structure is symbolic in terms of architecture and execution (Pic.7).
This memorial has tried to connect the onlooker with the work by using formal expression and common patterns in Islamic architecture such as dome arches and center oriented plans that are familiar to onlookers. While these kinds of forms, remind us more of religious and pilgrimage places. Also it can act as a sign element because of its height and specific location finding.

The Memorial of Martyrs of Country, Qazvin
This building has two interior and exterior Cross-Vaults, a total of eight vaults, in remembrance of eight years of Sacred Defense and eight anonymous martyrs of this tomb. The height of exterior structure of this memorial that is the highest memorial of anonymous martyrs in the Country is 36 meters and the height of interior structure is 15 meters from adjacent ground level. The composition of these two scales with extroverted approach in urban scale and introverted approach in human scale and by using a unit form induces two opposite concepts besides its simplicity (Pic.8).
High altitude can bold the role of building as a sign but has no effect on its relation with the concept of martyrdom. This memorial again was designed by using Islamic architecture elements such as: form of arches, openings, being center oriented and quadruple and also emphasis on numbers like eight arches to symbolize the eight years of Sacred Defense. These kinds of actions are declined repeated approaches that will be difficult to understand for the general public.


Pic 9: The memorial of martyrs of Valfajr 10. Source: http://rahianenoor.com/vgld.f0k2yt0kxhf62yyal..html
On the contrary, it was better to use more understandable and familiar expressive ways for people.

The Memorial of Martyrs of "Valfajr 10"
Some memorials related to the eight years of Sacred Defense has been built in operational areas and tries to preserve memories and symbols associated with it including memorial of martyrs of Valfajr 10 in the path of Rahian-e Noor that reminds the scenes of operational areas (Pic. 9).
In this work also realism and museum renovation has been considered. In fact these memorials rather intend to recreate real scenes of sacred defense. Reminding of memories and war landscape will be the main function of such memorials.

The Memorial of Martyrs of "Bolhassan"
Bolhassan is the name of a village in the west of Baneh. This region was one of the main axes in operation of Karbala 10 and "Nasr 4". The memorial of martyrs of Bolhassan is one of the regions visited by pilgrims of north western Rahian-e Noor caravans (Pic.10).
This memorial has been established to preserve and introduce one of the operational places in west of Iran during eight years of Sacred Defense and martyrs of this region. Interventions in this site are the minimum and it has been tried to define the space by installing flags on the way leading to the hill that was the place of operation. In comparison with other memorial, the memorial of Bolhassan has a better spatial feeling although can’t remind of events occurred in the place as well and transfer visual information of location to the audience.

The Memorial of Dehlaviyeh (memorial of martyr Dr. Chamran)
Dehlaviyeh is a village in southeast of Bostan and south of Sableh river that is located at north side of Bostan – Susanagerd road. This memorial built in west of Dehlaviyeh

Pic 10: The memorial of martyrs of Bolhassan.
Source: http://rahianenoor.com/vgjcpxpa2bqes,s8a2215..html.

Pic 11: The memorial of Dehlaviyeh (memorial of martyr Dr. Chamran).
Source: http://khademanshohada.blog.ir.
village where martyr Chamran injured and ten years later an anonymous martyr buried in central area of this memorial. This memorial was built in an area of over 440 square meters and has a row staircase to a tower on four corners. This memorial has a library and an exhibition of pictures and documents of his childhood, adolescence, youth and his battles in Lebanon front and also his pictures in battle fronts till the moment of martyrdom (Pic.11).

The memorial of martyr Chamran is built to emphasis on location of an impressive event during war. This work reminds of tomb architecture and also the form of an observation tower. This memorial is considered an identifiable and minimal work in terms of architecture but the audience can hardly communicate visually and mentally to the type of event (mortar shell hit and martyrdom of Dr. Chamran).

Summary of War Memorials in Iran
Studying the examples of war memorials in Iran indicates that from three different approaches for representation of war, two of them, the memorial of anonymous martyrs or specifying the place and in these two, tomb architecture and museum recreating are being used more. Among this, representation of value concepts such as sacrifice and patriotism is hard because they are abstract and less noticeable. So memorials of martyrs tend to formal and tomb architecture and have a poor visual and mental connection with the concepts of martyrdom and sacred defense (Table 2). Now the question arises of whether using formal architecture, with less indication of the meaning of martyrdom, is an appropriate response to the war memorial design. Does a memorial play its role and perform its function properly in this case?

How is the continuity of war memorials' role?
Although the memorial is being built at present, but generally targets the next and subsequent generations. Therefore for this purpose, at least two fundamental cases should be noticed: first, intensive influential power and the second, interpretability of work while it is comprehensible (what it refers to). Direct expression can communicate faster with audience but does not leave much ability to interpret. Accordingly the memorials that are created with realist approach get more feedbacks in a short time but over time the attention of people to them will be reduced and they would be less repetitive and reminded for audiences. As a result, they will have short-lived impacts. On the contrary, memorials that are more abstract are less communicative at first glance with general public but can involve audiences because of interpretability and hidden aspects of work and over time new semantic layers would be discovered in their mind. In this case, the building or memorial landscape won’t be repetitive for audience and passing of time won’t fade it away.

In addition to expressive approach of a memorial artwork, there are other elements that affect the continuity of memorials. The comparison of information obtained from table 1 presents these items for stability of a war memorial landscape:

• Attention to human scale in designing memorials for making connection with audiences or foreign visitors and their perception of space (Zarghami and others, 2014).
• Location finding of memorials in main event’s location (originality) or public gathering places to increase the chance of encounters.

Pic 10: The memorial of martyrs of Bolhassan.
Source: http://rahianemoor.com/vgicxopw2bcvew.s8as2asf..html.
Pic 12: “Korean war veterans’ memorial.” This work with direct and realistic expression can communicate with audiences immediately but correspondingly can be repetitive and boring for the visitor. Source: koreanwarvetsmemorial.org.

• Quantity could have a double impact on the audience in memory of those who have been killed.
• The merging of the memorials with public spaces in the cities can lead to creation of a multi-functional space.
• Holding regular and live ceremonies can involve citizens with original memory and hasten concept transmission. Although the items above affect the success of a monument but selecting and applying each of them requires the use of appropriate language. In other words, using all possible strategies and actions for the success of a memorial work, follows the approach which designer selects. Inappropriate expression can neutralize the impact of all suggested strategies. This is why the “expressive approach” continues to be of primary importance.

Conclusion | War memorials can be studied and criticized from different aspects. This article with focus on the way of expression in a memorial is looking for the answer of this question: which expressive way in war memorials ensures their stability?
As mentioned, the war memorials propound three main categories. One category is memorial for war dead that mostly include tombs and inscriptions that remind the troops in battle and is built to respect them. In this category it’s easier to choose the way of expression because the theme is tangible and objective. Studied examples in this research like “Australian War Memorial” (pic. 1) can be a good pattern for those memorials that use abstract and symbolic expressions. Second category is places that remind of war memories. In this case there is an emphasis on realism but abstract forms can be used for specifying a place (the ring of remembrance- pic. 13). But the third category is related to war memories, concepts and values. In this case a mental affair should be embodied as a physical work. For instance how endurance and courage of the people of Khorramshahr should be depicted? Realistic approach like “Warsaw Monument Uprising” (pic. 5) or “Korean war veterans’ memorial” (Pic.12) communicate with audiences immediately but correspondingly can be repetitive and boring for the visitor. The lack of other semantic layers and simplicity of reading this landscape isn’t considered an advantage for a memorial artwork. On the contrary, works that have abstract and metaphorical approach always make
audiences curious and induce them to explore by involving a person’s mind. War memorials in Iran desperately try to rebuild reality and repeat real scenes (pics. 1 and 9). Although the depicted scenes are familiar and tangible but the empty place of concepts such as martyrdom, faith, sacrifice and resistance is felt. In fact, the audience can not necessarily understand inherent values of war just by dealing with similar views of war. This is where memorial landscape becomes important and symbols and physical elements can carry subjective meaning. “Memorial to victims of violence” in Mexico (pic. 3) is an appropriate pattern for recreating the concept of perseverance in landscape. As the same way, we can use abstract forms and metaphorical patterns to transfer value concepts to audience. The red color alone could represent the concept of martyrdom (red footprint on the ground in Bosnia and Herzegovina war memorial). It is not necessary to make a life-size statue to portray the death of a man. Especially that today’s generation taste has changed and tends to complexity. The Diagram 1 shows that we encounter a spectrum in designing memorials that on one side of it there is metaphor and abstract forms and on the other is realism and formal architecture that tends to museum look of war. Studying foreign and national examples indicates that museum look can be used for representing memories of a place and on the contrary abstract and metaphorical expression must be used for expressing war values. Mistake in selecting the appropriate approach will make the memorial ineffective and confront the continuation of memories and war values with failure.
Endnotes

* This paper is based on a research project titled "warscape and city" which was conducted by NAZAR research center.

Reference List